

Arthur H. Bryant (SBN 208365)
BAILEY & GLASSER, LLP
1999 Harrison Street, Suite 660
Oakland, CA 94612
Tel.: (510) 272-8000
Fax: (510) 436-0291
E-mail: abryant@baileyglasser.com

Benjamin L. Bailey (*admitted pro hac*)
BAILEY & GLASSER, LLP
209 Capitol Street
Charleston, WV 25301
Tel: (304) 345-6555
Fax: (304) 342-1110
E-mail: bbailey@baileyglasser.com

Joshua I. Hammack (*admitted pro hac*)
BAILEY & GLASSER, LLP
1055 Thomas Jefferson Street NW, Suite 540
Washington, DC 20007
Tel.: (202) 548-7798
Fax: (202) 463-2103
E-mail: jhammack@baileyglasser.com

Counsel for Amici Curiae

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

IN RE: ROUNDUP PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

Ramirez, et al. v. Monsanto Co., Case No.
3:19-cv-02224

MDL NO. 2741

Case No. 3:16-md-02741-VC

**OPPOSITION OF 93 LAW FIRMS
AND 167 LAWYERS AS AMICI
CURIAE TO MOTION FOR
PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF
PROPOSED CLASS
SETTLEMENT, APPOINTMENT
OF INTERIM CLASS AND
SUBCLASS COUNSEL,
DIRECTION OF NOTICE
UNDER FED. R. CIV. P. 23(e),
SCHEDULING OF A FAIRNESS
HEARING, AND STAY OF THE
FILING AND PROSECUTION OF
ROUNDUP-RELATED ACTIONS
BY SETTLEMENT CLASS
MEMBERS**

The Honorable Vince Chhabria

Date: March 31, 2021

Time: 10:00 am

Courtroom 4 – 17th Floor

Last July, this Court described Monsanto’s first proposed Roundup “futures” class settlement (“Plan A”) as “questionable,” not “appropriate,” and “dubious,” articulating several specific “concerns” making the Court “skeptical” of the settlement’s “propriety and fairness”—and thus of why any “potential class member” would “want” to be part of it:

[I]t’s unclear how the [settlement] . . . would benefit a class of Roundup users who either have cancer but have not yet sued Monsanto or have not yet developed cancer . . .

Why would a potential class member want to replace a jury trial and the right to seek punitive damages with the process contemplated by the settlement agreement?

In any area where the science may be evolving, how could it be appropriate to lock in a decision from a panel of scientists for all future cases? . . .

Given the diffuse, contingent, and indeterminate nature of the proposed class, it seems unlikely that most class members would have an opportunity to consider in a meaningful way (if at all) whether it is in their best interest to join the class. . . . For example, the idea that a migrant farmworker or someone who is employed part time by a small gardening business would receive proper notification (much less the opportunity to consider their options in a meaningful way) is dubious.

Doc. 11182 at 3. In light of this rebuke, Monsanto and putative class counsel promptly withdrew Plan A.

Now they are back with “Plan B”—but little has changed. Although some proposed terms have been tweaked, the major components that drew this Court’s skepticism—lack of meaningful notice, the waiver of punitive damages, and the formation of a secret science panel—remain intact. To those exposed to Roundup, “Plan B” is a solution in search of a problem. The only purported benefit being offered is an administrative system whereby putative class members can submit their case to a claims administrator and be provided an offer. However, there is nothing stopping Monsanto from doing that, by itself, today. There is no need for judicial imprimatur, much less for this class to be certified.

Amici Curiae are 93 law firms and 167 lawyers that write collectively from their long and

varied experience representing people injured physically, emotionally, or financially by the conduct of others.¹ This collective experience gives *amici* meaningful perspective on the best ways that our clients and other injury victims can engage with the judicial system. To us, it is clear that the proposed settlement before this Court would not benefit the injured class members. Nor would this type of “settlement” benefit people injured by widespread corporate misconduct in any of the areas of law in which we practice.

We briefly discuss just a few of the settlement’s serious problems below.

Wholesale Release of Punitive Damages: The settlement gives up all of the class members’ punitive damages claims. The sole justification provided for this is that Monsanto has been “punished” and “deterred” enough by the payment of up to \$9,600,000,000 in settlements.² Under no federal or state law, however, does a calculation exist to justify barring an individual from asking that the perpetrator of her or his injuries be punished in this way. In fact, no federal or state law permits *any* injury victim to be barred from seeking punitive damages because a wrongdoer reached settlements with others—or, for that matter, paid compensatory or punitive damages to others, which must be limited to amounts appropriate for the harm the wrongdoer did to *those individuals*. Moreover, Monsanto has continued to manufacture its product in spite of the cancer it was causing, continued to manufacture and sell its product after these verdicts, and, as part of this “settlement,” will be permitted to continue to manufacture its dangerous product

¹ A list of the law firms is attached as Exhibit A. A list of the lawyers is attached as Exhibit B.

² There have also been three punitive damages awards. *See Hardeman v. Monsanto Co.*, 385 F. Supp. 3d 1042, 1048 (N.D. Cal. 2019) (punitive damages reduced from \$75 million to \$20 million); *Johnson v. Monsanto Co.*, No. GC16550128, 2018 WL 5246323, at *5 (Cal. Super. Oct. 22, 2018) (punitive damages reduced from \$250 million to \$39.25 million); *Johnson*, 52 Cal. App. 5th 454, 463 (2020) (punitive damages reduced further to \$10.25 million); *Pilliod v. Monsanto Co.*, No. RG-17-862702, 2019 WL 3540107, at *12 (Cal. Super. July 26, 2019) (punitive damages for two plaintiffs reduced from \$1 billion each to \$24.5 million and \$44.8 million). *Hardeman* and *Pilliod* are on appeal.

unabated long into the future—all while class members and other members of the public will continue to be exposed.³ This is neither punishment nor deterrence. It is an unconscionable gift to Monsanto.

A Four-Year Stay on Judicial Proceedings: The settlement stays all litigation for class members for four years. This is anathema to the effective representation of injured individuals. Why should people wait four years to be able to file a lawsuit, and then, with the congestion of courts, another three to five years before a trial? In those four years and the later intervening time, no doubt people will die, many as a result of the cancer that Monsanto gave them, and potentially lose their rights to some causes of action and/or measures of damages. Recognizing this, many courts, as in California's CCP36, *expedite* hearings so such individuals will not have to wait. The proposed settlement, in contrast, *delays* their hearings. In these cases, justice delayed will truly be justice denied. Why should injured victims be deprived of the relief that they so urgently need? Such a stay is unprecedented in our jurisprudence. It should not be countenanced by this or any other court in any litigation involving injured individuals.

A Secret Science Panel: The ostensible justification for a four-year stay is the formation of a science panel. The premise for this panel of scientists, constructed to exclude anyone in the world who has already researched the product and found it in any way dangerous, is that it will operate in total darkness, its work hidden, its process hidden, and its members only subject to a single carefully controlled deposition. Its conclusions will then be presented to juries as “stipulated facts” from an “independent” panel. Regardless of the weight juries and other judges will give this, why is this something that is advantageous to victims? Which plaintiff in any

³ Without going into detail, in *In Re: Diet Drugs (Phentermine/Fenfluramine/Dexenfluramine) Prods. Liab. Litig.*, 369 F.3d 293, 317 (3d Cir. 2004), the lead case relied on in the Motion for Preliminary Approval, Doc. 12509 at 13 n.1, the offending product had long been off the market and its use was by prescription.

litigation has ever requested such a panel? Our court systems are public for a reason. Factual determinations should never be made in secret by a private group, not subject to review or cross-examination. Any secret, private expert panel desecrates the openness and transparency of the legal process—and eviscerates the right to trial by jury. It violates a core principle at the heart of our common law system: that juries and (in appropriate circumstances) judges decide critical issues of fact.

In conclusion, we believe that this proposed settlement will not benefit injured Roundup victims, but, instead, will merely allow Monsanto to cap its risk and calculate the injuries and suffering it has caused, is causing, and will continue to cause as just one more cost of doing business. People exposed to dangerous products should not be forced, generally unknowingly, to give up rights that they otherwise would have. It is not the judicial system's job to allow Monsanto to continue to manufacture its product and be able to calculate its potential risk. The judicial system should *prevent* such an outcome, not bless it. Its job is to give aggrieved parties the opportunity to make themselves whole, seek recompense for their injuries, and, when harmed by malicious conduct, punish the party who hurt them.

We, therefore, respectfully submit that this Court should deny approval of this repackaged class settlement. Such a settlement should never be approved.

Dated: March 5, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Arthur H. Bryant

Arthur H. Bryant (SBN 208365)

BAILEY & GLASSER, LLP

1999 Harrison Street, Suite 660

Oakland, CA 94612

Tel.: (510) 272-8000

Fax: (510) 436-0291

E-mail: abryant@baileyglasser.com

Benjamin L. Bailey (*admitted pro hac*)

BAILEY & GLASSER, LLP

209 Capitol Street
Charleston, WV 25301
Tel: (304) 345-6555
Fax: (304) 342-1110
E-mail: bbailey@baileyglasser.com

Joshua I. Hammack (*admitted pro hac*)
BAILEY & GLASSER, LLP
1055 Thomas Jefferson Street NW, Suite 540
Washington, DC 20007
Tel.: (202) 548-7798
Fax: (202) 463-2103
E-mail: jhammack@baileyglasser.com

Counsel for Amici Curiae

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on March 5, 2021, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing on counsel of record.

Dated: March 5, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Arthur H. Bryant
Arthur H. Bryant (SBN 208365)

EXHIBIT
A

Ramirez v. Monsanto Co.**Law Firms Opposing Proposed Settlement as *Amici Curiae***

Name	Location
Bailey & Glasser, LLP	Charleston, WV
Bailey Cowan Heckaman	Houston, TX
Baron and Blue	Dallas, TX
Baston Law, P.C.	Dallas, TX
Belluck & Fox	New York, NY
Bergman Draper Oslund	Seattle, WA
Bernstein Liebhard, LLP	New York, NY
Bisnar Chase	Newport Beach, CA
Brayton Purcell, LLP	Novato, CA
Brown Kiely, LLP	Bethesda, MD
Bush & Miller, Attys at Law P	College Pk, GA
Cappolino, Dodd & Krebs LLP	Temple, TX
Carichoff Law Group PC	Folsom, CA
Chandler, McNulty	Houston, TX
Charles G. Monnett III & Associates	Charlotte, NC
Cooper Elliott	Columbus OH
Danziger & De Llano, LLP	Houston, TX
DelHomme & Associates	Dallas, TX
Early, Lucarelli, Sweeney & Meisenkothe, LLC	New Haven, CT
Elrod Pope Law Firm	Rock Hill, SC
Fears Nachawati, PLLC	Dallas, TX
Forester Haynie	Dallas, TX
Frost Law Firm, PC	San Pedro, CA
Galiher, DeRobertis & Waxman	Honolulu, HI
Goldberg Persky & White	Pittsburgh, PA
Handley Law Center	El Reno, OK
Harowitz & Tigerman, LLP	Pacific, CA
Hart Law Firm	Summerville, SC
Hendler Flores Law, PLLC	Austin, TX
Herren Law, PLLC	Lexington, KY
Humphry Law Firm, P.C.	Des Moines, IA
Jernigan Law Firm	Raleigh, NC
John Michael Bailey Injury Lawyers	Memphis, TN
Jones Ward PLC	Louisville, KY
Kaiser Gornick LLP	Alamo, CA
Kazan, McClain, Satterley & Greenwood	Oakland, CA
Kohn Law Office	Oceanside, CA
Landry & Swarr	New Orleans, LA
Lane & Lane, LLC	Chicago, IL
Law Offices of DOBS	Dallas, TX

Name	Location
Law Offices of G. Oliver Koppell & Associates	New York, NY
Law Offices of Mary Alice McLarty	Dallas, TX
Law Offices of Mitchell J. Howie	Huntsville, AL
Law Offices of Ralph Dowden	Clovis, NM
Law Offices of Sean R. Cox	Dallas, TX
Legally Pink Law	Winter Park, FL
Levy Law Firm	New York, NY
Littlepage Booth Leckman	Houston, TX
Locks Law Firm	Philadelphia, PA
Lubel Voyles LLP	Houston, TX
Madeksho Law Firm	Woodland Hills, CA
Martzell, Bickford and Centola	New Orleans, LA
Maune Raichle Hartley French & Mudd	Portland, OR
McDermott & Hickey	Rocky River, OH
McRae Law Firm	Jackson, MS
Meirowitz & Wasserberg, LLP	New York, NY
Moody Law	Little Rock, AR
Morris Law Firm	Burbank, CA
Nass Cancelliere	Philadelphia, PA
Nemeroff Law Firm	Park City, UT
Patten, Wornom, Hatten & Diamonstein, LC	Newport News, VA
Pearce Lewis LLP	San Francisco, CA
Penner Law	Lafayette, LA
Phillip S. Georges, PLLC	Nashville, TN
Richardson Richardson Boudreaux	Tulsa, OK
Richmond Vona, LLC	Buffalo, NY
Rogers, Patrick, Westbrook & Brickman, LLC	Aiken, SC
Savinis, Kane & Galluci, LLC	Pittsburgh, PA
Serling & Abramson, P.C.	Birmingham, MI
Shepard Law, P.C.	Boston, MA
Shingler Law	Walnut Creek, CA
Simmons, Hanly, Conroy	San Francisco, CA
Simon Greenstone Panatier	Dallas, TX
Skolnick Law	Oceanside, CA
Smith LaCien, LLP	Chicago, IL
Stuemke Law Firm	Southlake, TX
The Barnes Firm	Oakland, CA
The Cheek Law Firm	New Orleans, LA
The Ferraro Law Firm	Miami, FL
The Kirbo Law Firm	Moultrie, GA
The Law Offices of Vic Feazell	Waco, TX
The Lovely Law Firm	Myrtle Beach, SC
The Mellino Law Firm, LLC	Rocky River, Ohio

Name	Location
The Paul Law Firm	Westlake Village, CA
The Phillips Law Firm	San Antonio, TX
Walker, Hamilton & Koenig, LLP	San Francisco, CA
Wallace & Graham, P.A.	Salisbury, NC
Waters Kraus	Dallas, TX
Worthington & Caron	San Pedro, CA
Wright & Schulte, LLC	Vandalia, OH
Zaytoun, Ballew, & Taylor	Raleigh, NC
Zelbst, Homes & Butler	Lawton, OK
Zinns Law, LLC	Atlanta, GA

EXHIBIT
B

*Ramirez v. Monsanto Co.***Lawyers Opposing Proposed Settlement as *Amici Curiae***

Name	Location
Denise Abrams	Oakland, CA
Eric Abramson	Birmingham, MI
Raymond S. Allred	Tulsa, OK
Dave Amell	Emeryville, CA
Michael Angelides	San Francisco, CA
Tom Antunovich	Newport Beach, CA
Ron Archer	San Pedro, CA
Benjamin L. Bailey	Charleston, WV
John Michael Bailey	Memphis, TN
Valerie D. Baston	Dallas, TX
Kelly Battley	Portland, OR
Joe Belluck	New York, NY
Rett D.B. Bergmark	Oakland, CA
Dawn Besserman	Tampa, FL
Scott Bickford	New Orleans, LA
Michael J. Blom	New York, NY
Lisa Blue	Dallas, TX
Justin Bosl	Oakland, CA
Trey Branham	Dallas, TX
Alan Brayton	Novato, CA
Gary L. Brayton	Novato, CA
Daniel A. Brown	Bethesda, MD
Arthur H. Bryant	Oakland, CA
J. David Butler	Aiken, SC
Joshua D. Cagle	Mount Pleasant, SC
James Campbell	St. Louis, MO
Michael Cancelliere	Philadelphia, PA
Robert A. Carichoff	Folsom, CA
John M. Caron	San Pedro, CA
James Catazaro	Waco, TX
Lawrence J. Centola	New Orleans, LA
Troy D. Chandler	Houston, TX
Brian D. Chase	Newport Beach, CA
Lindsey A. Cheek	New Orleans, LA
Andrew Chew	Novato, CA
Kimberly Chu	Novato, CA
Denyse Clancy	Oakland, CA
Hugh C. Cook	Novato, CA

Name	Location
Charles "Chip" H. Cooper Jr.	Columbus, OH
Sean R. Cox	Dallas, TX
Rod de Llano	Houston, TX
Beverly A. DelHomme	Dallas, TX
David R. Donadio	Novato, CA
Ralph Dowden	Clovis, NM
Andrew DuPont	Philadelphia, PA
Morris Dweck	New York, NY
Alice E. Emerson	Portland, OR
Erica L. Falkner	Novato, CA
Misty Farris	Dallas, TX
Valerie S. Farwell	Temple, TX
Vic Feazell	Waco, TX
James L. Ferraro Jr.	Miami, FL
Janine M. Fiel-Cosse	Novato, CA
Bart French	St. Louis, MO
Philip S. Georges	Nashville, TN
Brian Glasser	Washington, DC
Meredith Good	Portland, OR
William M. Graham	Salisbury, NC
Richard M. Grant	Novato, CA
Jennifer Green	Tacoma, WA
David C. Greenstone	Dallas, TX
Gordon Greenwood	Oakland, CA
Carlos Guzman	Emeryville, CA
Joshua I. Hammack	Washington, DC
Fletcher D. Handley Jr.	El Reno, OK
Thomas H. Hart III	Summerville, SC
Christian Hartley	Mt. Pleasant, SC
William W.C. Harty	Newport News, VA
Matthew Haynie	New York, NY
Scott Hendler	Austin, TX
Curt F. Hennecke	Novato, CA
Thomas K. Herren	Lexington, KY
Christopher J. Hickey	Rocky River, OH
Brandy A. Hillman-Azevedo	Novato, CA
Philip C. Hoffman	New Orleans, LA
Mitchell J. Howie	Huntsville, AL
Marc A. Humphrey	Des Moines, IA
Leonard T. Jernigan Jr.	Raleigh, NC

Name	Location
Lawrence L. Jones II	Louisville, KY
Jeffrey A. Kaiser	Alamo, CA
John R. Kane	Pittsburgh, PA
Jennifer Aybar Karr	Winter Park, FL
Steven Kazan	Oakland, CA
Cliff Kirbo	Moultrie, GA
Russell S. Kohn	Oceanside, CA
G. Oliver Koppell	New York, NY
Peter A. Kraus	Dallas, TX
Mickey Landry	New Orleans, LA
Scott D. Lane	Chicago, IL
Stephen I. Lane	Chicago, IL
John Langdoc	Oakland, CA
Jack G. Leader	Rock Hill, SC
Bryn G. Letsch	Novato, CA
Zoe Littlepage	Houston, TX
Justin M. Lovely	Myrtle Beach, SC
Angela Madeksho	Woodland Hills, CA
Christopher L. Madeksho	Woodland Hills, CA
John P. Mason	Novato, CA
Bruce E. Mattock	Pittsburgh, PA
Neil Maune	St. Louis, MO
David McClain	Oakland, CA
Darren McDowell	Dallas, TX
Mary Alice McLarty	Dallas, TX
Chuck McRae	Jackson, MS
Samuel Meirowitz	New York, NY
Chris Meisenkothen	New Haven, CT
Christopher M. Mellino	Rocky River, OH
Charles Monnett	Charlotte, NC
Edward O. Moody	Little Rock, AR
James A. Morris Jr.	Burbank, CA
Daniel J. Morse	Novato, CA
Nate Mudd	Edwardsville, IL
Edward Nass	Philadelphia, PA
Neil F. Nazareth	New Orleans, LA
Rick Nemeroff	Park City, UT
Jon Neumann	St. Louis, MO
James P. Nevin	Novato, CA
Michael V. Oltmann	St. Louis, MO

Name	Location
Rabiah Oral	Emeryville, CA
Vanessa J. Firnhaber Oslund	Seattle, WA
Chris Panatier	Dallas, TX
Michael B. Patronella	Houston, TX
Steven J. Patti	Novato, CA
Jerry Neil Paul	Westlake Village, CA
Timothy F. Pearce	San Francisco, CA
D'Ann "Dee" Penner	Lafayette, LA
R. Bruce Phillips	San Antonio, TX
E. Thomas Pinnell	Mount Pleasant, SC
Brenda D. Posada	Novato, CA
Gilbert L. Purcell	Novato, CA
Marcus Raichle	St. Louis, MO
Randy Reagan	Houston, TX
Christine A. Renken	Novato, CA
Steve Rineberg	St. Louis, MO
Jason M. Rose	Novato, CA
Will Ruiz	Emeryville, CA
Carolyn Salzmann	Winter Park, FL
Joseph D. Satterley	Oakland, CA
Ann Saucer	Dallas, TX
Steve Schulte	Dallas, TX
Autumn A. Sepulveda	Emeryville, CA
Michael Shepard	Boston, MA
Ron Shingler	Walnut Creek, CA
Richard W. Shulte	Vandalia, OH
Jeffrey B. Simon	Dallas, TX
Suzanne Skolnick	Oceanside, CA
Geoff T. Sloniker	Novato, CA
Todd Smith	Chicago, IL
Eric C. Solomon	Novato, CA
Jay Stuemke	Southlake, TX
Frank J. Swarr	New Orleans, LA
Clay Thompson	St. Louis, MO
Lin Thunder	Portland, OR
Stephen Tigerman	Pacific, CA
Keith R. Vona	Buffalo, NY
Betty B. Walker	College Pk, GA
Walter "Skip" H. Walker III	San Francisco, CA
Mona Lisa Wallace	Salisbury, NC

Name	Location
Daniel Wasserberg	New York, NY
Ilana K. Waxman	Honolulu, HI
Nancy T. Williams	Novato, CA
Kenneth J. Wilson	Aiken, SC
Roger G. Worthington	San Pedro, CA
Jason Yampolsky	Philadelphia, PA
Robert Zaytoun	Raleigh, NC
John P. Zelbst	Lawton, OK
Sharon J. Zinns	Atlanta, GA